



**Teacher-Student Relationship in
“The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie”**

العلاقة بين الطالب و المعلم في رواية
" قمة تألق الأنسة جين برودي "

Prepared by: Najeh Isa Abuzahra

The Supervisor

Dr. Fatima Jafar

**A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment for the Degree
of Master of Arts in English Language and Literature**

Department of English Language and Literature

Faculty of Arts and Science

Middle East University

Amman – Jordan

2012

Authorization

I, Najeh Abuzahra, authorize Middle East University for Graduate Studies to provide libraries, organizations and even persons with copies of my thesis when required.

Signature



15/1/2013

Thesis Committee Decision

This thesis entitled, *Teacher-Student Relationship in the Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* was successfully defended and approved on 15 January 2013.

Examination committee

- 1- Dr Fatima Abdelhaleem Jaffar
- 2- Professor Riydh Fayz Hossien.
- 3- Professor Raja'ee Rasheed El Khanjee

signature



Riydh Hossien



Acknowledgement

I am grateful to Almighty Allah for his bounty that helped me complete this work. I would like to express my sincere gratitude and deep appreciation to my supervisor Dr. Fatima Ja'afar for her encouragement, generous support and valuable suggestions, which made this thesis appear in its final form. I am deeply indebted to her and have enjoyed working with her.

I placed on record, my deep thanks to the head and staff of the Department of English Language and Literature at Middle East University for Graduate Studies for their help and cooperation. Special thanks are extended to committee members for their useful help.

I also thank my friends for their continuous encouragement and support. And also to those, who directly or indirectly, have lent their helping hand in this venture, specially my students.

Dedication

I dedicate this work to my great parents and siblings. To my courteous wife,

my cute son “*Moody*” and sweet daughter “*soo*” for they have awaited me

counting days and nights.

Table of Contents

Title	Page
Authorization	ii
Thesis Decision	iii
Acknowledgement	iv
Dedication	v
Table of Contents	vi
Abstract	viii
Chapter One. Introduction	1
Background	2
Statement of the Problem	3
Questions of the Study	4
Objectives of the Study	4
Significance of the Study	5
Definition of Literary Terms	5
Chapter Two. Review of Literature	6
Literature about the Novel	6

Literature about the Teacher Student Relationship	8
Chapter three Methodology	14
The Method	14
Sample of the Study	14
Instrument of the Study	15
Procedures of the Study	18
Chapter Four Findings and Discussion	19
Answers to the Questions	45
Chapter Five Conclusions and Recommendations	47
The Recommendations	50
References	52

Abstract

This study aims at investigating the teacher-student relationship inside and outside the school, in this particular novel *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*. Because of the big importance of the teacher's influence on the students Spark has pointed to this universal and everlasting educational problem. The teacher is the milestone in the class.

This novel was studied through examining some situations from it and comparing them to an educational model developed for this study. These situations were applied to the model, to find out whether or not Miss Brodie matches its fundamentals. It was found that Miss Brodie has broken the boundaries.

The investigation and the evaluation of the situations finally answered the following three questions:

- 1) To what extent did Miss Jean Brodie keep the boundaries in her relationship with her students?

Miss Jean Brodie did not keep the boundaries between herself and her students.

- 2) What are the influences of Miss Brodie on her students?

There were many influences of Miss Brodie on her students: positive and negative influences.

- 3) What are the positive and the negative consequences for her actions?

There were many positive and negative consequences to Miss Jean Brodie's actions and behaviors, an example of the positive ones: Miss Brodie followed a pretty good practical technique and referring to nature education. On the other hand the negatives, presenting one significant example: Miss Brodie has failed to prepare her students to be beneficial members in their society.

Finally, the study asserted that the teacher should keep the boundaries between him/her and the students, and must accomplish the expected goal from him/her during the set time, to keep their respect toward him/her as a good model. The family and the school have their responsibilities, they have to fulfill throughout the continuous observation and control during this educational process.

Key Word: Teacher-Student Relationship

الملخص

تهدف هذه الدراسة لبحث علاقة المعلم والطالب داخل وخارج المدرسة في رواية " قمة نألق الأنسة جين برودي". لاهمية تأثير المعلم على الطالب داخل و خارج المدرسة, نوهت سبارك الى هذه المشكلة التعليمية العالمية و الازلية. المعلم هو الركن الاساسي في الصف.

تمت دراسة هذه الرواية من خلال تناول مواقف منها وتطبيقها و مقارنتها مع قواعد النموذج التعليمي الذي وضع لهذه الدراسة. لقد تم تقييم تلك المواقف حسب قواعد و طرق ذلك النموذج لتحديد ما اذا كانت قد حافظت على تلك الحدود ام لا. و قد اوضحت الدراسة انها لم تحافظ على تلك الحدود, بل انها لم تتقيد بالقواعد والقيود المحددة.

و قد اتى هذا البحث و التقييم في النهاية باجابات الاسئلة التالية:

(1) لاي مدى ابقت الانسة جين برودي على الحدود بينها وبين طلابها في علاقتها بهم؟

لم تحافظ الانسة جين برودي على الحدود بينها و بين طلابها.

(2) ما هي تأثيرات الانسة برودي على طالباتها؟

لقد كان هناك الكثير من التأثيرات الايجابية و السلبية للآنسة برودي على طالباتها.

(3) ما هي العواقب الايجابية و السلبية لتصرفات المعلمة برودي؟

هناك الكثير من العواقب الايجابية و السلبية لافعال و تصرفات الانسة برودي, مثال على

الاجابية: لقد اتبعت الانسة برودي طريقة حسنة وهي عملية وتعتمد على الطبيعة في

التعليم.

من ناحية اخرى السلبية, فسنعرض مثال ذا اهمية, حيث ان الانسة برودي فشلت في

تهيئة طالباتها ليكن عضوات فاعلات في مجتمعهن.

واخيرا, يجب على المعلم ان يحافظ على الحدود بينه و بين طلابه, وان يحقق الهدف المتوقع

تحقيقه خلال المدة المحددة ليبقي على احترام الطلاب له كنموذج حسن. على العائلة و الادارة

المدرسية مسؤوليات يجب اتمامها بالمتابعة والضبط في خضم العملية التعليمية.

كلمات مفتاحية علاقة الطالب بالمعلم

Chapter One

Introduction

Novels tell stories, which are typically defined as a series of events described in a sequence. The novel has been a part of human culture for over a thousand years, although its origins are somewhat debated. Regardless of how it began, the novel has risen to prominence and remained one of the most popular and treasured examples of human culture and writing.

The novel has its elements, just like any other genre of literature. These elements build it up, and make its significance, its main elements are; plot, characters, dialogue, time and place of action, style and a stated or implied philosophy of life (Hudson, 2006: 131). The novel is best known for depicting life, so that it must shed light on a certain issue in life (Devasia and Tharu, 2005), and presenting real or fictive people to an idealized royalty in a less realistic way (Upham, 2000).

Every novelist has his/ her own concerns, and so the novels vary and may be beneficial for the society. Some novelists care for nature and saving it, others religion and spiritual aspects, while others are concerned with the educational side. The novel of the present study is one of those which are about the educational aspects; it is about a teacher's relationship with her students. It was written by Muriel Spark.

1.1. Background of the novel, *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* and the novelist Muriel Spark.

Dame Muriel Spark, in full Muriel Sarah Spark, was born in 1918 in Edinburgh, Scotland, and died on April 13th 2006 in Florence, Italy. Spark is a British writer best known for the satire and wit with which the serious themes of her novels are presented.

Critic Page, (1990) has mentioned in his *Macmillan Modern Novelists: Muriel Spark* that Spark was educated in Edinburgh and later spent some years in Central Africa; the latter served as the setting for her first volume of short stories, *The Go-Away Bird and Other Stories* (1958). She returned to Great Britain during World War II and worked for the Foreign Office, writing propaganda. She then served as General Secretary of the Poetry Society and editor of *The Poetry Review* (1947–49). She later published a series of critical biographies of literary figures and editions of 19th-century letters, including *Child of Light: A Reassessment of Mary Wollstonecraft Shelley* (1951), *John Masefield* (1953), and *The Brontë Letters* (1954). Spark converted to Roman Catholicism in 1954, a move that had significant influence on her novels. Before 1957 Spark published only criticism and poetry (Page, 1990)

Her first novel *The Comforters* saw light in 1957, in which she “... wrote a novel to work out the technique first, to sort of make it all right with” herself “to write a novel at all. ...”, as she stated in an interview quoted in *Macmillan Modern Novelists: Muriel Spark* (1990: 10). After this novel came *Robinson* (1958), *Memento Mori* (1959), *The Ballad of Peckham Rey* (1960), *The Bachelors* (1960), *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* (1961), and *The Girls of Slender Means* (1963). All these novels were written in the early period (Page, 1990)

The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie is known as her masterpiece. Some critics assume that it refers to her own life, part of her life, whereas others do not. This novel is the work intended to be studied in this thesis. It deals with more than one topic; it mirrors the environment, it somehow documents a period of time. This novel could be read by teachers, most often, perhaps teachers of girls. What is important is that it contains an important educational topic worth studying in detail. It represents historical, artistic, touristic, sexual and educational information. Miss Jean Brodie is a teacher in a girls school, she has a group of girls; Brodie Set, and dominates them and their lives emotionally and psychologically.

Miss Jean Brodie is a single woman who lost her beloved in World War I, and lives alone. She traveled many times, so she has wide knowledge. As a teacher at a girl's school, she neglects the standard curriculum, claiming that she is following the "lead out" style in teaching, and feeds the girls' heads with information on emotional, social, political, and ideological interests of her own. One of her students commits suicide, another is involved in a sexual relationship with her teacher whereas another one spies on them. This spy (Sandy), the antagonist of Miss Brodie, is the one who betrays her, and tells the headmistress about her political preferences and that she admires Mussolini and Hitler, which causes her a forced retirement. The one that Miss Brodie trusts is the very one who betrays her, Sandy Stranger. She becomes a nun and writes a book, whereas her teacher dies with cancer, not knowing who has betrayed her.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

This study attempts to find out the educational messages that this novel intended to send through its main character Miss Jean Brodie. The study aims at knowing to what extent Miss Jean Brodie kept the teacher-student relationship boundaries in her relationship

with the students, the influences that had followed to exerting her power on students, and whether these influences were positive or negative or even detrimental to them.

1.3. Questions of the Study

This study attempts to answer the following questions:

- 4) To what extent did Miss Jean Brodie keep the boundaries in her relationship with her students?
- 5) What are the influences of Miss Brodie on her students?
- 6) What are the positive and the negative consequences for her actions?

1.4. Objectives of the Study

This study aims at:

- 1- Showing the type of teacher-student relationship in this novel through the way Miss Brodie deals with her students.
- 2- Finding the impacts Miss Brodie had on her students, negatively or positively.
- 3- Defining the consequences following her actions.

1.5. Significance of the Study

The study is devoted to exploring a very important educational lesson that can be inferred from Muriel Spark's *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*, and how the teacher in the novel could affect the lives and fortune of her students. It is expected that this study will be an addition to the literary criticism on this novel. To the researcher's best knowledge, novels concerned with educational themes are rare, thus, this study could shed light on this side of the theme of education in novels.

1.6. Definition of Literary terms

Teacher-Student Relationship

Zhang, (2009:116) defines this term as follows: "It is a concentrated expression of human interaction in such particular social situation, ...; accordingly, interaction effects are not only affected by the interaction of teaching, but also closely interfered with the group identity of teachers and students ...".

The practical definition used in this study is the Teacher-Student Relationship of Miss Jean Brodie and her students, the specific nature of this relationship, and its consequences.

Chapter Two

Review of Literature

This chapter presents the theoretical literature related to this study, which can help understanding it better, keeping in mind that this book is a piece of literature, not educational in the first place and, as much as the researcher knows, there is no much research on educational fiction as far as he knows. This review is divided into two parts: the first part presents the literature about the novel *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*, whereas the second part presents the educational background of the teacher student relationship

Literature about the Novel

Page, (1990) states that Miss Jean Brodie projects upon this impressionable "set" her strong fascist opinions. She controls this group on the basis that she is in her prime. Page, (39) reports what Hart has stated that Miss Brodie is an arrogant ruler who is imposing herself on these little girls. Brodie's fascist ideological preferences and actions as a revolution against the common political and social conditions appeared in the way with which she treated the girls.

He adds that when Sandy pejoratively uses the personality traits and ideology of Brodie to overthrow her, by unveiling them. Spark's view is clearly opposed to the kind of authoritarian power and control that is exercised over the impressionable adolescents by a conniving school teacher. The writer thus uses the pitfalls of social conformity found in classical studies, in order to make specific points.

Cengage, (1997) remarks on Spark's writing and narrative organization, praising it as concise and economical. She reported that this novel is perfectly woven and nothing is to be wasted, though the work is about the big waste of the human being. She gives such a judgment although many scholars, like Cengage has reported in the same essay, considering the novel a controversial work, covering different points at the same time; studying the characters of Sandy and Miss Broudie while others see it is a metafictional novel, whereas others think that it is an autobiography of the author in her early life. Spark thinks that telling the truth is not easy, even dangerous. Such views are interesting since they refer to the multiplicity and incompatibility of the views and judgments this novel stirs.

Spark, (2000) McWilliam, in her introduction to this novel, asserts that Miss Jean Brodie is interested in fascism, by romantic death, by war, by myth, by the old songs, though at a certain point we realize that she is falsely dragged into that channel (*The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*. 2000). So she is far away from the reality lived by these small girls. Spark has shown us this fact many times, for instance in the Old Town the girls were scared and holding hands while she was talking about history.

Duncker, (2002) and many other critics consider *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* to be Spark's finest novel. Commentators have noted its thematic richness as well as its technical achievements, particularly Spark's handling of time through flashbacks and flash-forwards, as Duncker through her comparison between Spark's *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* and Bronte's *Villette* states that both writers uses the same play, on time tenses.

They show the fate of the characters at an early time, and also take the reader back to the past any time they need, which is a clever way of making them overstep the limits

and making her own prejudgment, as well as the opposition of their heroines. The reader comes to know that Miss Jean Brodie receives her fate not so far from the beginning, which is also an interesting thing in this novel. She adds that those girls suffer the subsequences of Brodie's dominance and none of them escapes this influence all her life.

McQuillan, (2002) states that Muriel Spark's fictions are not far from reality; Her novels are a conductor for all the signs and meanings in circulation in the contemporary scene; decolonization of the fifties in her short stories, the feminist concerns of the sixties in Jean Brodie, the Eichmann trial in *The Mandlebaum Gate*. Her Catholicism is certainly a point of reference for the reader. *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* is a novel which is carefully woven, and in a precise way, which makes it, though economical, full of information and displays what is needed, so there is nothing to be thrown away. That means every paragraph, sentence, word or even a punctuation mark is used in the appropriate time and place.

Kellehm, (2007) comments that Miss Jean Brodie is not all bad; she is an artistic historian and free educator. She has challenged all the educational and societal borders and conventions. She showed this set of girls the way to understand, to imagine and to create their independence and confidence.

Literature about the Teacher Student Relationship

The teacher's personality and style and the surrounding circumstances and conditions play a part in the students' success. Also the student's age and personality style have their effects on the whole process. The good student-teacher relationship often leads to increasing student's achievement. These views of Garcia, et al, (2011) have been used to

confirm that the teacher is the maestro and the focal character, besides the other important elements including the student him/ herself.

Kabir, (2011) illustrates in his article that the teacher-student relationship differs from other relations, that the teacher cannot treat the student like those in other relationships, for the corporal relationship is built on the benefit and winning base. However the teacher-student relationship must be based on dedication and mutual respect, the dedication from the teacher at least, who does not expect any reward from the student in return. And also mutual respect from both of them, especially when the teacher treats the student in a way that does not drive him/ her away from the whole education process. If a student, in any level, hates the teacher, his academic achievement will be affected, and also his relation with the whole staff will be so bad as well.

Zhang, (2010) asserts that the teacher-student relationship is an emotional experience established during the interaction; teaching and learning process, which expands to the psychological, personal and moral relationships. It tends to be emotional with multiple attributes with a direct impact of both parties. With regard to the type of this relationship which pays attention to the students' independent personality, she states that (118) "key point between teacher and students should be the relationship between [one human] and [another human], and equal intersubjective relationship between [you] and [me], which becomes the mainstream gradually". She quotes a Chinese famous man's saying that the teacher in school is the basic element and if that is ruined the whole other elements will be damaged.

In her thesis, Glarvin (2009) refers to the definition of the positive teacher- student relationship by Mendler as a personal interaction that affects the academic and the social achievement. This interaction must have mutual trust and respect, so it will raise eagerness to learn from a teacher who likes to teach. The result will sum the success of both social and educational progress.

The teacher student-relationship has a great importance, which is eminently reflected on the student's achievement and the schools' culture. Every school team cares for the culture of the school, so that, they try their best to make the student -teacher relationship cultured and educational as much as possible, on one hand. On the other hand, the teacher as a professional has to manage this relation friendly and beneficial. (Junkere, 2009)

Katz, (2006) in his essay discusses some features that make up the trustworthiness of the teacher. He asserts that the teacher has to accomplish his/her duties as an employee, has to protect and well treat the students, since the teacher is a "loco parentis"(2), must fulfill this position to raise the students in an appropriate shape; socially, religiously, psychologically and of course educationally in the first place. Teachers are human beings and so they are susceptible to commit mistakes harmful to students, even though they do that in good faith. Consequently teachers have to decide and differentiate between what is harmful and what is beneficial for the students, since their influence will make a big difference.

Savitha, (2006) reports in her *Studies in Literature* that psychology and art always illustrate one another. It seems that the psychological and the sociological aspects around the teacher and the student play a significant role in the educational process.

The emotional and social supportive discussion between the teacher and the student makes it easier for the students to overcome the difficulties they face throughout the course of life, which affects the academic achievements. A reciprocal positive interaction takes place when the student and the teacher are involved in the student's social environment. (Hamer & Pianta, 2006)

Pandey, (2006) has asserted that teachers should have some basic characteristics in order to be capable and can manage the position and the actions during the education process.

Rienhartz and Beach (2004) have clarified that "autonomy involves respecting the rights of others and allowing them to choose and act according to their own values and beliefs."(72) this is in respect of leading and treating the students as human beings, and also the successful leader has to work as a part of a group.

Dobrinsky, et al, (2004) point that teacher-student relationship is only one variable in the educational process, and it might be considered as an interpersonal relationship, when they are out of the class. This interpersonal relationship depends on these individuals as ordinary people not as a teacher and a student. They assert that this relation is on a psychological level and when it occurs, it must be built on equality. This interaction was found, to be helpful to the students in order to achieve better results, and it is classified as positive, when the teacher shares some personal information with the student. This relationship is supposed to create a big amount of trust and intimacy.

They also refer to who shall control, as a part of this interpersonal relation; to be the leader and has the power in this relationship. Depending on their sociological rank, the

teacher is the one who leads and controls in the school which may give him/ her the right to be also outside the school since the teacher is more trustworthy than the student. Besides, there are two other interpersonal dimensions; intimacy and immediacy, though they think that the intimacy is different from the immediacy, because the former is related so much with the romantic relationships.

Day, Harris, Hadfield, Tolley and Beresford, (2003) have asserted in their statement, “a good leader is a part of a group and moves with it, not necessarily always taking the lead. Leadership is about vision, ... also involves ethos of the school...”(65).

Huitt, (2003) in his transactional model states that the output, student’s achievement, is the most important variable in the educational process, yet he did not neglect the huge responsibility of the teacher and his/her behavior, planning and instruction, which meant the actually guiding student to learning, during the process.

Gaarder (1996) in his novel *Sophie's World*, which is considered to be educational in its way of teaching a young girl, talks about Alberto who teaches the teenager, Sophie, the history of philosophy. She gets substantive and understandable letters asking two questions; "who are you?" and "where does this world come from?" Along with the philosophy lessons, Sophie and Alberto try to outwit the mysterious Albert Knag, who appears to have God-like powers, which Alberto finds quite troubling.

Slavin (1987a, 1994) identifies the crucial elements of schools and classroom organization and their interrelationships. There are four important elements, which must be adequate to for instruction to be effective, which are: the quality of instruction, appropriate levels of instruction, incentive, and time.

This Review of Literature represents many aspects of the novel and the teacher-student relationship, but the current study focuses on a specific side of the novel, the educational one; the teacher-student relationship, and the consequences of this relationship. Thus it tends to be selective in certain situations.

This review has opened a wide vision for the researcher, to investigate the goal of this study in a better way. The researcher now has a good background about the teacher-student relationship, the boundaries and the limits of both the teacher and the student in order to establish a beneficial positive educational relationship. The review has given the researcher the incentive to build the methodology and evaluate what has been done according to the rules already made by researchers and specialists in the same field.

Chapter Three

Methodology

This chapter presents the methods and the design used in the study, as well as the procedures. The questions of the study were answered at the end, based on the discussion of each situation.

3.1. The Method

This is an analytical and descriptive study, dealing with the teacher-student relationship and its various manifestations. The researcher analyzed the main character of Sparks' novel *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*, the teacher Miss Jean Brodie, and the way she treated and dealt with the group of girls, called 'The Brodie Set'. The analysis was centered on three domains: Social, Educational and Psychological. It also evaluates this relationship, the way both the teacher and the students interacted, and the direct and indirect consequences of this relationship.

3.2. Sample of the study

The actions of Miss Brodie and the reactions of the group of girl were divided into situations taken from the novel. Fifteen situations were chosen according to their suitability to the studied dimensions as purposeful sample.

These situations were analyzed according to the effect of each one of them. Each situation was described as understood from the novel, followed by quotation from the text,

with reference to the page where it occurs. Critics' viewpoints were mentioned, if there were any, and the educational background was mentioned gradually. At the end of each situation's discussion it was evaluated accordingly.

3.3. Instrument of the Study

The instrument of the study consisted of three models: The Transactional Model, The Effective Instruction, and The Pragmatic Theory. These models are summarized as follows:

I. Transactional Model.

It was developed in 2003 by the educational thinker William G. Huitt, and based on the study of teaching/ learning process as a system of four categories: context, input, classroom processes and the output.

The teacher is considered responsible for carrying out the procedures to achieve the objectives of the teaching/ learning process. In this model the teacher is placed in its working part, which makes the change and develops the output. The output in this model's point of view is the most important variable; it shows the results of the teacher's work and the input's evaluation. The input is supposed to be changed and developed if needed.

II. Model of Effective Instruction.

It was developed by Robert E. Slavin (1987, 1994) describing the critical elements regarding schools and classroom organization, strategies, procedures to be applied and their interrelationships. This model points that there are four

interrelated elements, i.e. they must be all together in order to achieve the best ultimate goal of teaching. These elements are: Quality, Appropriateness, Incentive, and Time. The teacher's role here is given a huge importance, that it is given two elements; the appropriateness and the incentive which shows the teacher in the centre of the process.

III. Pragmatism.

The fundamentals and merits of this humanistic philosophy present the general ideas that the educational process in life should consider the student's needs and enable sustainable learning for better future for individuals, creating the suitable atmosphere to achieve the life-long goals of education. The preparation of new generation aware of the human, social and educational sides of individual needs is main issue of this philosophy.

The developed model for this study consisted of the following fundamentals extracted from the three models mentioned. Puri, (2006, 124-127) in *Education Theory Practice*, Slavin's (1994) *Model of Effective Instruction* and Huitt, W. (2003). *A Transactional Model of the Teaching/Learning Process*.

During the evaluation the researcher focused on the points and fundamentals that help and relevant to this study, so that not all the rules were taken in consideration or even mentioned in the study. This combination of models came out as follows:

- 1- Input: teacher characteristics and student characteristics.
- 2- Classroom processes: teacher behavior, student behavior and other.

- 3- Output: student achievement and other.
- 4- Quality of instruction: the degree to which information or skills are presented to the students can easily learn them.
- 5- Incentive: the degree to which the teacher makes sure that the students are motivated to work on instructional tasks and to learn the material being presented.
- 6- Time: The degree to which students are given enough time to learn the material being taught.
- 7- Faith in social interaction: It is the sole source of human development, and help to acquire desirable social and moral attitudes.
- 8- Human initiative: Pragmatism has total faith in man's prowess, capacity and initiative as man is competent to bring circumstances to his own advantage and that of society.
- 9- Education is life related: Experiences are the sole source of knowledge... and provides a child with concrete and specific opportunities.
- 10- Education is growth: Life is in change, so is society. Education should create such circumstances that help the growth and development.
- 11- Reconstruction of experiences: Dewey described education as a process of reconstruction or reinstitution of experiences.
- 12- Social process: Education is an interactive process that takes place in a social matrix, helping a child not only to acquire knowledge and information through experience, but also help him to acquire socially desirable attitudes, habits and qualities which would eventually help him for social adjustment, wellbeing and happiness. Education should make a child better adjusted toward himself and society.

Evaluation of the situations was based on their compatibility with the model items, when applicable the situation was considered positive, if not it was considered negative. Situations were evaluated to be neutral when the action and reaction were neither positive nor negative, and the researcher referred to the general norms of the society.

3.4. Procedures of the study

The study followed the following procedures:

- 1- Reading the novel *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie* by Muriel Spark.
- 2- Selecting the situations according to their suitability for the purpose of the study.
- 3- Discussing the situations according to the effect and consequence on both the teacher and the students.
- 4- Evaluating the situation and collecting the findings of the study that answer the questions.
- 5- Writing the conclusions and Recommendations.

Chapter Four

Findings and Discussion

This chapter deals with the presentation of the situations, their analysis of them, evaluation of the situations as positive, negative or neutral, and finally classification of the situation in order to answer the questions of the study accordingly. The situations were evaluated according to the model developed which was found to explain the way Miss Brodie treated her students.

The Situations and Discussion

4.1. The Social Domain

Situation One: Extracurricular

This situation showed how Miss Jean Brodie taught her students giving them extracurricular knowledge. Miss Mackay, the headmistress, at the beginning of the novel, when once was talking about the Brodie set, said that the girls were informed in many subjects and knew so many things that their peers never heard of. Those days, girls were not used to having the chance to know that much of information in different disciplines, because of the conservative society they belonged to.

The novelist referred to this situation when she said that “These girls been recognizable as being vastly informed on a lot of subjects irrelevant to the authorized curriculum.” (P.5). The person who was feeding these heads with that abundant information

was their favorite teacher: Miss Jean Brodie. As she had travelled to different directions of the world during her holidays, she had collected a good amount of information in different fields. This teacher told her students about “the Italian Renaissance painters, they were aware of the existence of Einstein [and also the description of] the decoration of the London house of the author of the *Winni the Pooh*”(p.5).

This situation can be viewed positively, because this much information would build up the personalities of these students, and would make them more confident. They would have discussed with any person in any of these topics which they have heard. All this is due to their teacher who fed their heads with this stuff.

This situation was the extracurricular knowledge. According to the developed model, it is one of its points to prepare the student for life since the experiences relate to the child’s life. Extracurricular knowledge is accepted unless it exceeds the norms and regulations. That’s why the researcher evaluated this situation a positive one.

Situation Two: The Girls’ Ideal

This situation reflects how the other students looked at Miss Brodie’s set.

It was seen as a sin or a mistake to be a member in the Brodie set. They were fourteen and tried to intermingle with the other students, it was obvious that the other girls were avoiding the group members and did not much like the Brodie group. So they were kept away from the other girls. It is clear in this situation that their connection with that

teacher caused them to be abandoned and avoided by their peers, for nothing but being of the Brodie set.

This is a problem to the teacher who was assumed to be building confident students and to make up good social members, who can easily deal with the other society members. The author comments “they remained unmistakably Brodie, and were all famous in the school, which is to say they were held in suspicion and not much liking” (p.6).

This description goes in agreement with Katz, (2006) who asserts that “a teacher’s role may more closely resemble that of a surrogate parent in that she is concerned directly with her students’ moral, social, and psychological development as well as their cognitive growth”. Also as Hamer & Pianta, (2006) assert that the emotional and social supportive discussion between the teacher and the student makes it easier for the students in order to overcome the obstacles they may face during the course of life.

Yet Miss Brodie had a different point of view; she turned this view upside down, the students could never take a significant decision nor could they build a healthy relationship in their society during their lives. In this case the very contrary took place; the girls have been avoided and kept alone.

This situation could be evaluated negatively, because Miss Brodie in this situation built an isolated group, they couldn’t communicate with the girls of the same age and the same school, when she was supposed to teach them how to build up a relationship with their peers, which contradicts with the developed model.

This situation was the girls’ ideal. It was counted against Miss Brodie; it contradicts with one of the developed model points. Miss Brodie has made an (Ideal) of herself, to

grasp them precisely in order to accomplish her plans. That's why this situation was considered to be negative.

Situation Three: Spirit and Isolation

This situation showed the team spirit among the group.

That isolation led to lack of team spirit, since they could not intermingle with the community, they were not able to interact with the school. As a matter of fact, it is a very bad feeling to be so isolated, but what is worse is to have this feeling without committing any mistake or sin.

The author referred to this when she said "They had no team spirit and very little in common with each other outside their continuing friendship with Jean Brodie" (p.6). It showed that Miss Brodie herself had a problem with the staff members; she was never mentioned discussing anything with any of the members. Instead she involved the girls with her problems with the headmistress, "This was the first intimation, to the girls, of an odds between Miss Brodie and the rest of the teaching staff" (P. 10).

Miss Brodie was supposed to prepare these girls in an appropriate way, to deal with the surrounding environment properly, but unfortunately she was putting in their heads bad walking examples on how to deal with the society around them, through her way of dealing with her colleagues and the headmistress, since she was their ideal.

Day, Harris, Hadfield, Tolley & Beresford, (2003) have classified the good leader as a part of a group and moves with it, and might be sometimes led by others for the group interest. In contrast Miss Brodie seemed unable to take care of them, it is implied to the

reader that Miss Brodie is a danger around there, as the author mentioned "...they followed the dangerous Miss Brodie into the secure shade of the elm" (p.10).

The Pragmatics emphasize the social interaction since "it helps polish one's personality as it is in this context that man acquires and develops such tangible graces like humility, love, sympathy, cooperation, and fellow feelings, that help him adjust and be a useful member of his group"(Puri, 2006:122). However the Brodie set could not start relationship with their peers and been isolated from the others.

This situation could be classified as negative, because Miss Brodie did not do what she was supposed to do. She did not educate the girls how to communicate with their surrounding and the whole society. They were not liked in their school and so they were isolated and abandoned, eventually, they had no team spirit.

This situation was the isolation which was counted negatively by the researcher, because it contradicts the developed model.

Situation Four: Contradiction

This situation focused on contradiction in the behavior of the teacher in front of her students. Miss Brodie looked really confusing; once she told the girls that she was treating them due to her old ways "I'm putting old heads on your young shoulders" which succeeded and produced the "cream de la cream" (p.8), i.e. the best of the best members in the society. At another, she stated that "this is nineteen thirty-six. The age of chivalry is

past” (p.10), revolting on the social traditions, boundaries and limitations. She was contradicting herself.

Since she herself seemed unsure or unstable, the girls that she would teach would be suspicious and uncertain accordingly. That’s why Marry faced her death going hither thither not knowing what to do. To this situation Katz, (2006) pointed that she is a dangerous person fulfilling her personal plans on the girls account.

This situation is also a negative one, depending on the consequences resultant from her way of dealing with the girls, and her way of speaking to them. She contradicted herself in two obvious statements she, unknowingly, changed the style and way of thinking because of these two contradicting statements. That leads to the fact that she was not following any particular style or way, and so she stated different statements in the same situation.

This situation was presents the contradiction in her personality and in dealing with the girls. Considering this situation as a negative one depends on the developed model and also on the fact that any process or project must have its fundamentals and techniques in order to help achieve the goals planned, while Miss Brodie did not have any specified theoretical way or exemplary style to be followed. This creates a disadvantage in her way of teaching.

The researcher evaluated this situation negatively since it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Five: The Surrounding Circumstances

This situation deals with the role of the parents in their children's life. They seem detached from interfering in the girls' education and what they were learning and how. Knowing that follow up and observation must not be dropped from the students' families yet the families, however, in this situation showed a different reaction.

The situation was narrated as follows by Spark:

Sandy's mother looked round the door and said, 'enjoying yourselves, darlings?' over her shoulder appeared the head of Jenny's mother. 'my word,' said Jenny's mother, looking at the tea table, 'they've been tucking in!'

Sandy felt offended and belittled by this. ... Sandy gave her mother a look of secret ferocity which meant: you promised to us all on our own, and a promise is a promise, you know it's very bad to break a promise to a child, you might ruin all my life by breaking my promise, it's my birthday. (p. 17)

By this family situation, which was the first time to mention, it appeared that they were spoiling their kids. These Mums should have had some control on their girls, in order to raise them appropriately. The parents' role is very important and can't be neglected in this process. One has to keep in mind that the teacher is still a human being and this human being is susceptible to make mistakes, and faults.

Another connected situation is the reaction of Jenny's Mum to the policy of Miss Brodie with these girls, she just commented on the way she taught and that's all for her,

“My mummy says Miss Brodie gives us too much freedom”(p.25). This doesn't seem a suitable reaction by a mother caring for her daughter. This also gave a good space to Miss Brodie to do whatever she wanted.

This has to do with how Miss Brodie was choosing her group according to her own criteria in order to accomplish her goals. Mrs. Spark has presented, in a long paragraph, that Miss Brodie has selected the girls

whose parents could trust not to lodge complaints about the more advanced and seditious aspects of her educational policy, these parents being either too enlightened to complain or too unenlightened, or too awed by their good fortune in getting their girls' education at endowed rates, or too trusting to question the value of what their daughters were learning at this school of sound reputation. (p.27)

As a matter of fact Miss Brodie was not the only responsible person in this situation, but also the family. The family did not do what they had to do, the family had to have control and observation on their children, to protect and advise them to the correct path. Hence this situation is classified as neutral. Classifying it as neutral doesn't mean that the teacher is an innocent person here, since she had to be in the place of the family, yet she is not the point of discussion here.

This situation was about the surrounding circumstances. The developed model has faith in social interaction on one hand, and in the truth that the human has limited capacities on the other. Also man is the creator of his environment, so that the surrounding social members have to be aware of what the teacher does exactly with their children.(p.124)

On these bases the researcher marked this situation to be the families' responsibility, as they did not look after their girls and never observed what's going on at school. So it was evaluated neutral because it did not agree nor contradict with the developed model.

4.2. The Educational Domain

Situation One: Cultural Knowledge

This situation illustrates the wide cultural knowledge Miss Brodie produced to her students which affected their educational achievement negatively.

Miss Mackay, the headmistress said, that their girls had a wide cultural knowledge. But unfortunately this information had nothing to do with the school and didn't help the girls in the examination, so that the headmistress felt so bad for that two dimensional fact.

She asserted that "These girls been recognizable as being vastly informed on a lot of subjects irrelevant to the authorized curriculum" (p.5). On the one hand, it was good to make the girls cultured and collect different types of information. On the other hand, this wide knowledge must not affect the main goal negatively, which is studying the authorized curriculum. Miss Brodie filled the heads of the girls with information irrelevant to the curriculum. She said "... meantime I will tell you about my last summer holiday in Egypt... I will tell you about care of the skin... about the French man I met... and I must tell you about the Italian paintings I saw" (p.11).

She was using her own way of educating, though it might be good and has some benefits, yet she has abandoned the curriculum set by the Ministry of Education and gave an external amount of information related to historical events, like about Mussolini and, artistic information, the Monalisa, and also information about her lovers(p.5).

Miss Brodie has interfered with the girls' daily life, she invited them to her home, “I should like you girls to come to supper tomorrow night” (p.9), during these meetings they were discussing nonsense which never helped the girls at school. She also put them into her own relationships role; Rose has to sleep instead of Miss Brodie with her lover, Sandy had to collect information for Miss Brodie, according to Brodie's plan, and Marry got killed in a battle she didn't have anything to do with but satisfying Miss Brodie.

The bitter truth is that this information did not help the girls to pass the qualification examination, nor to choose between the Classical and the Modern sides when turned to the senior school. This is because this information has nothing to do with the school curriculum. The author informed the reader that this knowledge did not help this set while registering for the classical side, which required a certain amount of marks, and so they were all refused because they did not match the needed score.

Miss Mackay had told the girls in advance that they couldn't apply for this side. She talked with Marry and informed her that her marks did not reach the required score, then Miss Mackay turned to Sandy and Jenny who also “opted for classical” (p.64) that it would not help them as much as the modern would do in their daily life. But the girls insisted, in order to satisfy Miss Brodie, but they had to face this bitter truth of their disability to enter that side.

The 'leading out' way seems to be far away from what she has been doing at this level of education; she was just playing in their minds to make them do what she has planned for them. One of the girls practiced a love story, another has been a private detective and so on so forth.

This situation was negative because Miss Brodie stuffed the girls' heads with external information that did not help the girls neither to pass the qualification examination nor to choose between the classical and the modern sides in the senior school. Also the type of information she presented to the girls was not suitable to their age and society.

This situation was far from the cultural knowledge. It was a result of what Miss Brodie has crammed the heads of girls. She did not stop at the accepted level of stuffing their heads with information irrelevant to the curriculum. The pragmatics called for "the experimental method [which] does help in developing an inquisitive mind, a progressive attitude and open mindedness" (Puri, 2006:135). Besides, the humanistic pragmatism considers the principles which "satisfy the needs, requirements, aspirations and goals of human beings..."(p.123) the very second fundamental for the pragmatism is " Truth lies in successful application and results" (Puri, 2006:124).

The researcher counted this situation negative as it contradicts with the developed model, and it had bad consequences on the girls.

Situation Two: Deception

This situation is concerned with the teacher deceiving her students. She represented a bad model by encouraging them to tell lies, when she said to them while talking about anything but lessons:

“If there are any intruders, we are doing our history lesson ... our poetry, English grammar” (p.11). The teacher has duties and these duties must be fulfilled, if the teacher can’t accomplish these duties he/she must quit or leave the field. The teacher is a “loco parentis” i.e. the teacher at school represents the parents and meet them, may be, more than their parents do; so the teacher must do his/her best in order to fill the parents’ place, educational and behavioral, not to deceive these innocents (Katz, 2006).

When Spark said that the girls were looking at this teacher, not on the books, who was betraying them at the very moment, she indicated that their future was being stolen in front of their little eyes (p.11).

Moreover Miss Brodie taught them to lie, she was not going to teach according to the authorized curriculum and told the girls if any intruder interrupted they would say they were doing their English grammar, history or poetry (p.11); She has taught the girls to lie, feeding their heads with body care and her own travels around the world (p.11), instead of widening their imagination and opening the gates of success in front of their minds.

This is classified as a negative situation, because the teacher did not do her duties, yet she was a bad model for her students. It was about deceiving the girls while they were looking at their teacher. This situation was considered negative because Miss Brodie was not benefiting the girls as an educator, she was running after her interests. The pragmatics see the Education “is an interactive process that takes place in a social matrix, helping a child not only to acquire knowledge and information through experience, but also help him to acquire socially desirable attitudes” ... “ should create dynamic adaptability and problem solving capacity... and must foster competence in children” (Puri, 2006:127).

The researcher found that this situation was negative because it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Three: Imposing Opinions

This situation deals with the educator's treatment of the students.

Miss Brodie asked the girls once in her inquiring way about the best Italian painter, the girls gave their answer, yet that answer was not matching her own preference, and so her reaction was aggressive for an educator, who should treat the students in a mild and educational way.

Zhang, (2010) asserted that in order to keep the emotional connection between the teacher and the students, the teacher should treat the students kindly, and also to raise these students' morals positively and in an appropriate way. Miss Brodie's question was about something artistic, i.e. not from the curriculum, it was as follows "who is the greatest Italian painter?"

"Leonardo de Vinci, Miss Brodie."

"That is incorrect. The answer is Ghottie, he is my favorite" (p.11).

This shows how arrogant she was, and the way as a teacher, she reacted to the students. Pandey (2006) reported that the teacher has to have some important characteristics in order to accomplish the position, some of these are: the power of spirit, pure mind and soul, and should possess great motives; all these should be presented with love and kindness. Miss Brodie has never dealt kindly with her students, she was a leader more than an educator all the time, and she didn't have the time to be kind.

It is a negative behavior in the teacher-student interaction, as there are many other ways to treat the girls, who are supposed to be her favorite. Looking at her way of dealing with these girls, it is found that she didn't give them a scope of thinking or giving their opinions which was reflected on their behavior.

This is a negative situation too, since the teacher is supposed to treat the students educationally and in a good manner. The teacher has to give the students the chance to think, then say that loudly, even if it was wrong, the teacher corrects the student smoothly and without harassing the student, and without imposing her own preference.

This situation is the educator's treatment of the students, which was negatively evaluated since the teacher should treat the children kindly and wisely, whereas Miss Brodie did not. It is found that the behavior of the teacher should be close to the students' level and mentality in a smooth way as (Zhang, 2010) has asserted.

This situation was evaluated negatively, since it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Four: The Leadership

In the next situation Spark continued to assure the reader that Miss Brodie was a governor and a harsh commander.

While Miss Brodie was talking about her prime once, she saw Mary looking at something else, then Miss Brodie asked her:

- "What are you looking at?"
- "a comic Miss Brodie" Mary replied ...

- “A comic paper, forsooth. How old are you?”
- “Ten, Ma’am”
- “You are too old for comic papers at ten. Give it to me.”

Here Spark continued narrating “Miss Brodie looked at the colored sheets ... threw it in the waste paper basket. Perceiving all eyes upon it, she lifted it out of the basket, tore it up beyond redemption and put it back” (p.11-12). This shows that she didn’t trust the girls, assuming that they would take it back after she gets out the class. The way she behaved did not suit the situation, the girls kept staring on the sheets but she then threw their tops to see them in the basket torn.

This leader, Brodie, wasn’t in a suitable position and didn’t match the criteria known in order to be a proper educator, as Day, Harris, Hadfield, Tolley and Beresford (2003) asserted that the good leader is a part of a group and moves with it, who might be sometimes led by others for the group interest since leadership is about vision and involves ethos of the school.

Rienhartz and Beach (2004) have clarified that the independency in teaching and leading the students needs respecting the rights of the others and allowing them to choose and act, keeping on their own values and beliefs.

This situation was negative, because she treated the students and prepared them as her obedient followers. These girls needed to be cured of not be ruled and governed.

Rienhartz and Beach, (2004) have clarified that the independency in teaching and leading the students needs respecting the rights of the others and allowing them to choose

and act and keeping on their own values and beliefs, which were not found in Brodie's leadership. She was following her own interest and beliefs, forgetting about the girls' rights and values.

This situation was about the leadership of Miss Brodie. It was evaluated negatively because Miss Brodie did not use this authority in a proper way because it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Five: Reciting

This situation illustrates the way the teacher taught her students, which seemed to be following none of the teaching and education methods, the carelessness shown by Miss Brodie was obvious when talking about lessons.

Poetry always needs illustration and explanation, Miss Brodie did not seem to be realizing this fact, so she asked the girls to recite while she was busy in something else. She was doing some sleeping practice, then she commented on some nonsense talking to Sandy, "Sandy are you in pain?" (p.22).

The writer said "Miss Brodie was reciting poetry to the class at quarter to four, to raise their minds before they went home. Miss Brodie's eyes were half shut and her head was thrown back." (p.21). The girls recited and finished, yet they heard nothing from their teacher no illustration, explanation, clarification nor comment.

Sandy started to put her expectations and the possibilities by her own; what shall these lines mean, and why, what would make the Lady of Shallot write these words ... all these inquiries and more were hitting Sandy's mind but there were no answers for her

inquiries since the teacher was half asleep (p.22). Here the author didn't let Miss Brodie fully sleep, because she is trying to tell the reader that when Miss Brodie was supposed to be doing her duties, actually she wasn't. During the reciting she commented on Sandy and talked about other thing irrelevant to the poem, while she was trying to put some illustrations by her own ideas (p.22).

Garcia, Kupezynski & Holland, (2011) have confirmed that the teacher is the maestro and the focal character in the class; they have asserted also that the good teacher student-relationship often leads to increase the student's performance and achievement. But in the presence of this teacher, Miss Brodie, there were no rules to be followed, there was no playing, neither chorus nor solo, in order to compose something.

This situation is counted negative, since Miss Jean Brodie did not do her duties and was escaping the illustration by speaking about something did not help the students to understand what was going on beneath those lines. This was what pushed Sandy to make some expectations by herself.

In this situation the girls were reciting poetry while their teacher was half asleep. The teacher was supposed to be illustrating and clarifying these lines.

Garcia, Kupezynski & Holland, (2011) have confirmed that the teacher is the maestro and the focal character in the class, thus the teacher should be explaining the poem at the time she was half asleep.

This situation led the researcher to evaluate it negatively, as it contradicts with the developed model.

4.3. The Psychological Domain

Situation One: A portrait of Brodie

From the very beginning of the novel the writer presented the girls as the Brodie Set, as if they were nothing or didn't deserve to have names or anything might have made them identified. The reader comes to read this piece of information before knowing Miss Brodie herself and will certainly take it into account.

Mrs. Spark wrote "these girls formed the Brodie set" (p.5), and "they remained unmistakably Brodie"(p.6). She bound these anonymous girls to Miss Brodie; by referring them in the beginning to Miss Brodie, the reader wherever meets any of the set after wards, will refer them to Miss Brodie.

Actually, many times Spark has hinted to the reader that the girls were a mere copy of Miss Jean Brody, a good example of that was Mr. Lloyd's portrait of the girls, which was very beautiful and attractive, yet there was something strange about it. In fact Sandy saw the portrait resembles Miss Brodie, though Mr. Lloyd didn't intend to do that. This resemblance was Sandy's own mind, she foresaw these girls a copy of Miss Brodie, and understood that being a copy of Miss Brodie will cause them many problems.

This situation was negative because Sandy, the antagonist of Miss Brodie, has found herself with the other members of the set to be erased by Miss Brodie and her way of dealing with these members. As a matter of fact, she didn't give the girls any chance for free thinking; so they were all bound to her. This situation led to the following consequences, presented in the following situation.

This situation referred to the idea of the group being a copy of Miss Brodie. Actually, this situation will find no corresponding fundamentals, not only in the Pragmatism but also in all the educational theories. No thinker would presume permitting the teacher to induce students to be another copy of her/ him. Miss Brodie did induce the girls to be what she was and to follow her footsteps.

So that the researcher evaluated this situation as a negative one as it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Two: Dominance

The next situation came to assure that Miss Brodie was to dominate this set, as her copy, of girls not only during the school time but for their whole lives, she was preparing soldiers for her commandeer, so that the consequences would be lasting in their lives, even after her death.

Miss Brodie said “Give me a girl in an impressionable age and she is mine for life” (p.9). “Walk with your heads up, up, like Sybil Thorndike, a woman of noble mien.” and in “a single file”(p.23) . ““We shall cross here,’ said Miss Brodie and herded the set across the road” (p.39).

Dobrinsky and Framer, (2004) pointed that the teacher student-relationship is an interpersonal relation when out of the class, which depends on these individuals as ordinary human beings. But it is on a psychological level and when it occurs it must be built on equality.

This type of relation is supposed to help the student's achievement to be positive, and to create a big amount of trust and intimacy. Zhang, (2010) also has asserted that the teacher-student relationship must take the human to human shape, yet Miss Brodie uttered these dictatorial words, showing more arrogance than any person can imagine.

Miss Brodie was busying herself in telling the girls about her travels and adventures throughout the world, forgetting about the curriculum, which she was supposed to be teaching to these girls, and so that resulted in a shortage in her stated duties. This is a real betrayal of the students who do not understand what is going on around them.

Miss Brodie's action was all greedy, that she used her social rank in order to control these girls, and complete her plan on the interest of the girls (Katz, 2006). This consequently led to losing trust and respect by the students toward the teacher, just like Sandy's opinion when she told Jenny not to tell Miss Brodie the secret incident happened to her in the summer time "don't tell Miss Brodie" (p.69).

This situation was also negative, since the teacher's role is to advise the students and teach them according to the curriculum prepared by the Ministry of Education in order to graduate useful humans, and to be able to solve their problems by themselves, yet, Miss Brodie was preparing some 'soldiers' to achieve her plans.

This situation symbolized the dominance of the teacher upon the girls. The pragmatics believes that the teacher's role is to "guide and put a child in the real situation of his life, so that he might be able to understand his life's problems and thereby solve them"(p.131). Then the student is not supposed to be ruled over and always receive commands and orders, like the way Miss Brodie was ordering her students.

The researcher found that this situation must be negative referring to developed model.

Situation Three: Love life

This situation represented the story about Hough, Miss Brodie's dead lover. The girls' imagination was that he was still alive, and they, Sandy and Jenny, could find him. After finding him they beseeched him to come back to Miss Brodie who was waiting for him.

The author presented this situation as follows, "... and extracted a notebook from between two sheaves of music. On the first page ...written,

'The Mountain of Eyrie: by Sandy Stranger and Jenny Gray'.

This was a story still in process of composition, about Miss Brodie's lover Hugh Carruthers." (p.18)

This topic was pushed out from their minds because they have been fed so much about it, so it flooded outside. They also might be thinking of a solution for their teacher in order to get rid of her, and rest with themselves in peace without Miss Brodie.

This trial to get rid of Miss Brodie might be called the first attempt by the girls, since the headmistress couldn't do that, trying and retrying the "plots" against her in vain "it has been suggested again that I should apply for a post at one of the progressive schools, where my methods would be more suited to the system than they are at Blaine" (p.9). Their innocence led them to postpone the publication of this story until their prime. It might be

the author's will to postpone their trial till they grow older to make sense of their deeds and become more significant in society, and also to convince the reader.

In this situation Miss Brodie did nothing directly, yet her influence was stored in the girls' minds through dictating on them her stories and her past. So her effect was psychological and deep in the girls' minds, which they've recalled and put in a plot in their own way. Zhang, (2010) agrees with this idea that the teacher-student relationship is an emotional experience established during the interaction; teaching and learning process, which expands to the psychological, personal and moral relationships, which is clearly evident in this situation.

The girls' reaction came as a piece of literature, their innocence, may be said, could not help but by this aperture. Savitha, (2006) claimed that the psychological and the artistic needs always meet and illustrate each other, in order to satisfy and relieve the human being, and so they have started composing this story unconsciously.

This situation is negative from one side and positive from another. These students could not help but composing fiction, Miss Brodie made them run away from the real world to a fictional world, though they were still very young; so she is the one to blame in this situation. Also examining this type of fiction in contrast with their age, it is found that Miss Brodie's ideas were in their writing. This idea of being able to write fiction seems somehow positive, and might be considered a way of exploring their imaginative and writing skills.

This situation was about Hough the lover of Miss Brodie. In this situation the little girls poured their psychological influences as a means of protest against Miss Brodie.

Comparing this situation to the limitations of the pragmatics, which “does not consider the past of any consequential relevance, and is dead. ... only the present and the immediate future have any empirical relevance.”(Puri, 2006:132) it is realized then that imposing the story of Miss Brodie’s lover on the girls is something unacceptable and inappropriate for the pragmatics. It is also irrelevant to the curriculum; the curriculum has its limits and abandoning them needs rules and indulgences, if talking about pragmatism.

So this situation was found negative and must be counted against Miss Brodie because it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Four: The Old Town

This situation involved considering the age and the mental growth of the students by the teacher.

In the old town Miss Brodie was talking about history and describing the surroundings, not realizing the girls’ feelings. The girls were frightened to death, yet their teacher was busy talking about something else; they were holding hands of each other tightly, and scared of the woman and the homeless children.

Spark presented the situation and gave a good paragraph in a detailed description, “a man sat on the icy-cold pavement; he just sat. A crowd of children, some without shoes, were plying some fight game, and some boys shouted after Miss Brodie’s violet-clad company... to be obscene. ... Sandy found she was holding Mary’s in her bewilderment, all the girls were holding hands, while Miss Brodie talked in history.” (p.33)

Starting with Sandy’s holding to Mary’s hand, the author implied, on one hand, that the girls were afraid that they did what they had just refused to do. At beginning of the trip,

Sandy told Mary that “I wouldn’t be walking with you if Jenny was here” (p.30), yet she held her hand during “her bewilderment” (p.33). ‘Her’ carried two references here; Mary’s and also Sandy’s. On the other hand, Spark implied the idea that Sandy will be holding these poor girls’ hands and release the students and get rid of Miss Brodie, although it was late, but she did it.

This situation is negative and can be counted against Miss Brodie. The author here tried to tell the reader that Miss Brodie was far away from these girls, and did not know their needs; so she would never fulfill them, hence she wasn’t an appropriate nor a reliable teacher.

This situation took place in an old town with horrible details. Though it is one of the pragmatism calls to teach the children using nature and investing it to make the students understand the real life through “the practical experience”, here Miss Brodie wasn’t practicing them correctly, i.e. she put the girls in situations which were negative to the girls more than the benefits they gained during that round. The girls were so scared that they committed deeds they would never do consciously; hence they would never gain benefit out of this round since they were scared, eventually the goal was not fulfilled and the girls’ loss was bigger than their gain.

This situation was evaluated negatively, because it contradicts with the developed model.

Situation Five: The Final Plot

Miss Jean Brodie has never been let alone by Miss Mackay, the headmistress; also Jenny's Mum commented on Miss Brodie's policy. The qualification examination inappropriate marks have led the girls to think, though in secrecy, to stop this catastrophic teacher in order to protect the generation to come from her. Consequently loyalty to Miss Brodie started to retrieve.

Sandy insisted not to tell Miss Brodie about Jenny's secret incident, but when Jenny asked about the reason Sandy could not find a clear-cut answer; so she started finding answers from the latest incidents. This leads to the fact that Sandy trusted Miss Brodie no more, unconsciously, but she did not realize what was going on there into her head, which can refer to her psychological sensibility as a more mature person than before. The author has presented the situation as follows " But something made Sandy say to Jenny on the first night of the term 'Don't tell Miss Brodie.' 'Why?' said Jenny. Sandy tried to work out the reason" (p.69).

After the end of the war, when Miss Brodie was sitting with Sandy, Miss Brodie told her that Mr. Lloyd had kissed her in the art room. That was the last year for her and also the last year for Sandy with her. This means that her influence on her students never ended though she has retired.

Sandy's action of 'betrayal' wasn't betrayal. She just stopped that sick teacher "I'm not interested in the world affairs, only in putting a stop to Miss Brodie"(p.125), preventing her from affecting another group of students and that was not betrayal. During this meeting Miss Brodie made a convenient confession; that she "admit and sometimes regretted urging

young Joyce Emily to go to Spain to fight for Franco... ." (p.124) which astonished Sandy "Did she go to fight for Franco?" She said.

"That was the intention." said Miss Brodie. Actually this made it easier for Sandy to make up her decision, and then she met Miss Mackay, the headmistress, and told her the short way to shake off Miss Jean Brodie. " ... But you won't be able to pin her down on sex, have you thought of politics? ... she's a born Fascist, have thought of that?" (p.124-5)

Sandy even helped her to rest for a period of time, since she suffered many times in life. Sandy's keeping on touch with her teacher symbolizes her loyalty even after her getting out of Edinburgh. Not only did Sandy keep contact with Miss Brodie but also most of the set members, Eunice even visited her grave after death and made prayers for her (p.27).

At the end of the book, Sandy, Sister Helena later, was asked by an inquiring young man, "What were the main influences of your school days, Sister Helena? Were they literary or political or personal? Was it Calvinism?"

"Sandy said: there was Miss Jean Brodie in her prime"(p.128). And so Spark ended the book with these meaningful words.

Miss Jean Brodie had nothing to do with this situation, so it is neutral to her. The person who was acting and reacting is Sandy; she is the one who was accused of betrayal, she was the one who plotted a plot, so it is neutral.

This situation was the final plot against Miss Jean Brodie. It was related to no theoretical approach, and Miss Brodie had nothing to do with this situation. Yet when

investigating the whole novel it is found that she is responsible for what happened to her and also for what happened to those poor girls. She had broken the rules of teaching and education; she had broken the social limits and restrictions and she was the one who caused the girls to fail the exam and be prevented from entering the section they wanted. As a matter of fact the consequences were distributed, and so she got her share. After all she cannot be blamed in this specific situation since she has been the one who has received the action.

This situation was evaluated neutral as it was irrelevant to any of the developed model, neither negatively nor positively.

Answers to the Questions of the Study

Based on the previous situation analysis, the answers to the questions of the study are as follows:

- 1) Question No. one: To what extent did Miss Jean Brodie keep the boundaries in her relationship with her students?

Miss Jean Brodie did not keep the boundaries of the teacher-student relationship, as she has broken the educational, social and psychological boundaries which led to unexpected catastrophic results.

- 2) What are the influences of Miss Jean Brodie on her students?

There were positive and negative influences which have affected the students' social, psychological and the educational achievement. They did not disappear with the end of school time, rather they affected the students' whole lives. The influence of the teacher on her students was negative completely.

- 3) What are the positive and the negative consequences of her actions?

There were many negative consequences, some of them are as follow: the death of one of the students, none of the students could enter the side that she opted for, their social relationships were bad, and finally, their educational achievements were not as they should be. In contrast, there were a few positive consequences, some of which are the students' wide background of external information, the students had the chance to visit some monuments and museums unlike their peers who didn't have that opportunity.

Chapter Five

Conclusions and Recommendations

The teacher-student relationship and the reciprocal impact on both were discussed in Chapter Four. The exact domains were the three major domains that affected both of them, the teacher and the student, are the Social, the Educational and the Psychological. As a matter of fact, the focus was on the novel by Muriel Spark, namely *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*. The researcher applied some situations from the novel on a developed model to suit this study, in order to evaluate Miss Brodie's way of teaching, and find out whether or not she was using an appropriate way in teaching and dealing with the students.

The researcher examined the consequences which resulted from the actions and how they affected both sides, because of her way of education and the actions she practiced throughout the novel in addition to her interference in the students' lives and involving them in her own odds and staff affairs. The researcher elaborated on the social and the family's role in the educational process and whether their role was, in this particular book, convenient and proper or it should have been assuming more responsibility and observation to their girls.

The very first search was on whether or not Miss Jean Brodie kept the boundaries and the distance between herself and her students. Eventually the researcher found that she did not keep the distance and exceeded the boundaries, which caused unexpected catastrophic results. Miss Brodie has broken the rules and the strategies of the developed model, after applying the way she was teaching and behaving through the situations. Miss

Brodie has been dealing the girls in accordance with her personal interests and plans, which contradicted with the developed model.

Miss Brodie has presented information to the girls that does not help to achieve the educational goal, incompatible with their social customs. The developed model encourages wide cultural knowledge, yet this would not affect the main goal of coming to school, which is to study hard subjects and be prepared for the daily life and to be a beneficial member in the society around the student.

Miss Brodie involved the girls in situations they did not have anything to do but satisfying Miss Jean Brodie as a commander and a leader. This was somehow contradicting the pragmatics' views, which stated that the teacher is to advise and pave the way for the student to understand and acquire the educational skills and lessons.

The findings have shown that Miss Brodie was not a loyal teacher; she has betrayed the girls that she was supposed to be raising and educating, yet that way she did not respect the girls while they were young and humble. After a while, one of the girls, whom she did not respect, has stopped respecting her as that girl's teacher, and as her model, she takes revenge in the same way her teacher has dealt with them.

The influence of the teacher on the student is something inevitable, yet the kind of the influence what counts. So what are the influences of Miss Brodie on her students? Miss Brodie has influenced the girls in a negative way, since she has performed unsuitable actions and committed wrong deeds. Seen from another angle, there were positive influences, just like telling the extracurricular information.

What are the positive and the negative consequences for her actions? Miss Brodie has betrayed the students and so they reacted in the same way. She has taught them to lie to their headmistress, the girls did not benefit from Miss Brodie in the educational aspect, as much as she supposed. She also ruined their relations with the surrounding people in the society.

The Brodie set couldn't communicate with their peers in the senior school, they remained Brodie. Miss Brodie pushed one of the girls to death, and another to build a love story with her teacher, while another girl to spy on the other. During the course of the novel the reader imagines that the students were a portrait or replica of Miss Brodie, as she has dragged them to be; the pragmatics believe that the teacher's role is to advise and raise the students in a good way in order to be beneficial members in society.

On the other hand Miss Brodie has fed their minds with extra cultural knowledge which their peers never heard of, which agrees with developed model to have wide cultural knowledge. She also taught them practically and used nature as a source for learning and education, which is a good way according to the developed model.

The situations were evaluated positive, negative or neutral; the sum of the every group was as follows:

The negative situations were twelve situations contradicting with katz, (2006) in being a loco parentis and fulfill the position of the educator with all its needs. It also does not agree with Hamre and Pianta (2006) who pointed that the teacher-student relationship must be a reciprocal positive interaction.

The positive situation was one which agrees with Gaarder (1991) in the way she used in teaching the set; she showed them real objects and talked about things relevant to life just like the way Knag used with Sophie.

The third group of situations was the neutral ones; they were two, since they were irrelevant to the teacher's actions and she did not have anything to do with them, they were counted neutral.

The Recommendations

With reference to the study analysis and results the researcher recommends the following:

- 1- The teacher should keep appropriate boundaries and the distance between him/her and the students.
- 2- The teacher should not disregard the social traditions and norms, and should stay aware to these traditions and norms.
- 3- The teacher should pay special attention to the type of information presented the students and whether it suits the students' age or not.
- 4- The families have responsibility for their side, they should observe what the teacher might be doing.
- 5- The schools have a part of responsibility shaped in following up and examining the teachers, what they are doing, and how it is going on with students.

6- This is suitable for in-service and pre-service teachers, not for the students pre-age.

7- There is a need for more research to be conducted on the area of education in literature.

References

- Cengage, G. (1997). "The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie. *E Notes*", (On- Line), available: <http://www.enotes.com/prime-misscriticism/prime-miss-jean-brodie-spark-muriel>.

- Day, C., Harris, A., Hadfield, M., Tolley, H. & Beresford, J. (2003). *Leading schools in times of change*. Great Britain: Marston Lindsay Rose International Ltd.

- Devasia, A. & Tharu, S. (2005). *Englishing endulekha*. (In). Kar, P. C. (Eds). *Critical theory: Western and Indian*. Delhi: Anurag Jain for Pencraft International.

- Dobransky, N. D.& Frymer, A. B. (2004) Developing the teacher student relationship through out of class communication. *Communication Quarterly*. (On Line), available: <http://business.highbeam.com/4052/article-1G1-124642763/developing-teacherstudent-relationships-through-out>.

- Duncker P. (2002). *The suggestive spectacle: queer passions in Bronte's Villette and the prime of miss Jean Brodie*. In McQuillan M. (Ed.). *Theorizing Muriel Spark: gender, race, deconstruction*. New York. Palgrave Publishersedited by Martin Mcquillan.

- Ellis, J. (2012). What is a novel. *Wise Geek*. (On- Line), available: <http://www.wisegeek.com/what-is-a-novel.htm>.

- Gaarder, G. (1996). *Sophie's World*. (Paultte Moler). USA. Farra, Straus and Cirux.

- Garcia, P., Kupezynski, L. K. & Holland, G. (2011). Impact of teacher personality styles on academic excellence of secondary students. *National Forum of Educational Journal*. 3(21). 1-8.

- Glarvin, Tracy, Dolezsar (2009). *Positive teacher-student relationships and their effects on students: five middle-years teachers' perceptions*. (Unpublished master's thesis), University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon: Canada.

- Hamre B.K. & Pianta R. C. (2006). Student–teacher relationships. *Chilcren's Needs III: Development, prevention, and intervention* (on- line), available: <http://psycnet.apa.org/index.cfm?fa=search.displayRecord&UID=2006-03571-005>

- Hudson, W.H.(2006). *An introduction to the study of literature*, India: Nice Printing Press.

- Huit. W. (2003). A transactional model of the teaching/learning process. *Educational Psychology Interactive*. Valdosta, GA: Valdosta State University, available: <http://www.edpsycinteractive.org/materials/tchlrmnd.html>

- Junkere. B. (2009) Teacher-student relationships. *Helium*. (on- line), available: <http://www.helium.com/items/1525527-teacher-student-relationship>

- Kabir. M. A. (2011) On Relationship: Teacher and Student. *Helium*. (On-Line), available: <http://www.helium.com/items/2074965-teacher-student-relationship>

- Katz. (2006) “Trust, Trustworthiness, Narcissism and Moral Blindness: An Examination of The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie. *Philosophy-of-Education*”, (On Line), available: <http://www.philosophy-of-education.org/pdfs/Saturday/Katz.pdf>.

- Kellehm. (2007) The prime of miss jean brodie by Muriel Spark. *Encyclopedia of Catholic Literature*. (On-Line), available: <http://kellehm.wordpress.com/2007/12/05/the-prime-of-miss-jean-brodie-by-muriel-spark/>

- McQuillan, M. (Ed.). (2002). *Theorizing Muriel Spark: gender, race, deconstruction*. New York. Palgrave Publishers edited by Martin Mcquillan.

- Page, N. (Ed). (1990). *Macmillan Modern novelists: Muriel Spark*, Hong Kong: Macmillan Education Ltd.

- Pandey, R. S. (2006) *Educational thoughts*. New Delhi: Adhyayan Publishers.

- Puri, U. (2006). *Education: theory practice*. New Delhi: Pragun Publications.

- Rienhartz, J. & Beach, D. M. (2004). *Educational leadership: changing schools, changing roles*. USA: Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data.

- Savitha, S. (2006). *Psychology and literature: C. G. Jung*. (In). Ray, M. K. (Ed.). *Studies in literature in English*. Delhi: Atlantica Publishers and Distributers

- Slavin, R. E. (1987) Cooperative learning: where behavioral and humanistic approaches to classroom motivation meet. *Elementary School Journal*, 88, 9-37.
Available on: <http://www.successforall.org/images/pdfs/modeleffect.htm>

- Slavin, R. E. (1994), *A model of effective instruction*. U.S.A.: John Hopkin University.

- Spar k, M.(2000). *The prime of miss Jean Brodie*, England: Clas Ltd. St Ives plc.

- Upham, A. H. (2000). *The typical form of English literature*. Oxford: AITBS Publishers and Contributors.

- Zhang, L. (2010). *Study on the satisfaction of the relationship between teachers and students under the impact of double factors in universities: a case study of empirical survey among the students of seven universities in China. International Journal of Psychological Studies*. 1 (2), 116-121.